

"A 'Red Rag' to an Infuriated Bull": American Flags, Canadian Vexilloclasts, and the Origins of Canadian Flag Culture, 1880–1930

Forrest D. Pass

No one knows precisely why the Yeomans boys, aged twelve and sixteen, decided to hoist Old Glory one fateful summer morning in 1892. It may have been a harmless expression of boyish mischief. Perhaps it was to honour the American ancestry of their father, the Reverend George Yeomans, a respected Presbyterian minister. Some even speculated that the elder Yeomans was an annexationist and that in raising the flag the family was displaying its true colours. Still others wondered if it might have been the only flag the young lads could obtain on the eve of an impending holiday. Whatever the reason, on 1 July, as the dawn's early light touched the rooftops of the sleepy village of Wiarton, Ontario, passersby were startled to see the star-spangled banner gallantly streaming from the roof of the Yeomans family hen house.

So startled, in fact, were the good burghers of Wiarton that someone promptly reported the offending flag to the village's reeve, D. M. Jermyn. The affront was ever the more shocking as this was Dominion Day, and it would not do to have an American flag flying over the village on the twenty-fifth anniversary of Canadian Confederation. Jermyn obligingly deputized three special constables to visit the Yeomans residence and request that the flag be removed. On arriving at the home, they found the flag still aloft, but only Mrs. Yeomans at home. There was no way that she was going to scale the walls of the chicken coop herself, but she readily granted permission to the constables to haul down the Stars and Stripes.

By this time, a crowd had assembled around the property, numbering between thirty and sixty-five excited onlookers. As the special constables clambered down from the roof of the hen house, they were no match for the zealous patriots in attendance. A group of young men wrested the flag from the constables' hands and proceeded to tear it to ribbons. According to one account, the town band arrived and strains of "God Save the Queen" accompanied the desecration. According to another, the crowd marched down the village's main thoroughfare, Berford Street, "waving the pieces of the unfortunate flag, singing and feeling as jubilant as if they had conquered the whole of the United States." The incident made national headlines, to the facetious delight of the editor of the local paper. "Wiarton is nothing if not notorious," he editorialized. "The tearing down of the Stars and Stripes from the roof of an outhouse on the premises of the Rev. Geo. Yeomans on Dominion Day will add loyalty to the already long list of notable features of our town and people that has made us so well known throughout this continent." He who would hoist an American flag in loyal Wiarton did so at his—or rather his flag's—peril.¹

As the years passed, however, and memory of the Dominion Day desecration faded, flag-flaunting American visitors to Wiarton became increasingly emboldened. Its location on the south shores of Lake Huron's Georgian Bay and its direct rail link with southern Ontario and the American Midwest made the town an attractive destination for holidaymakers from both sides of the border. By 1909, American flags in Wiarton again warranted official notice. "I decided to venture to write you in respect to the excessive use of the American flag at all our Summer resorts," wrote Yeomans' Methodist counterpart, the Reverend Clifford T. Bennett, to Sir James Pliny Whitney, Premier of Ontario. Bennett alleged that tourists from the States formed "little American colonies" in lakeside communities, including Wiarton, where they flew their own flag to the exclusion of British or Canadian emblems. He hoped that the government might introduce legislation to prevent "indiscriminate" display of the American flag on Canadian soil. "We have been insulted quite enough by Americans," he asserted. Whitney agreed, noting that Americans did not tolerate the display of British flags on their territory. "I hope the present condition of affairs will not always continue," concluded the premier's reply, though he stopped short of promising the requested legislation.²

Bennett's 1909 letter and the actions of the 1892 mob were contrasting responses to the same phenomenon: by the turn of the twentieth century, the American flag had become a common sight in Canada. It identified American ships in Canadian waters and American consulates in Canadian cities. Canadian businesses and fraternal societies regularly flew the flag to welcome visiting Americans, and American expatriates displayed it freely on their homes and businesses, especially on the Fourth of July. Occasionally hoisted by pranksters or political radicals, the flag was more often displayed as simple

decoration, without any political motivation. Nevertheless, some Canadians objected stridently to its proliferation. "A Yankee flag to them is like a 'red rag' to an infuriated bull," quipped the editor of the Newmarket, Ontario, *Era* in describing his more nationalistic compatriots in 1911. The infuriated bulls were more common than might be imagined. Combing period newspapers, research has uncovered some sixty American "flag incidents" in Canada between 1880 and 1920. Ranging from strongly worded letters like Clifford Bennett's to the vigilantism observed in Wiarton in 1892, these are only the incidents that attracted the attention of the press; more, perhaps many more, escaped public notice.

The preponderance of American flags in Canada and the variety of Canadian responses it provoked were symptomatic of Canadians' ambivalence toward their southern neighbour. On the one hand, the two countries had much in common. Geography and a common language brought them together from the outset; by the end of nineteenth century, roads and railways, shipping lanes and telegraph lines crisscrossed the border and bound Canadians and Americans even more closely. Then, as now, the North American commercial relationship was extraordinarily close. By 1901, the United States was the source of most of Canada's imports and by 1921 it overtook Great Britain as the principal destination for the country's exports. Close, too, were social relations. In 1901, American-born residents accounted for some 2.5 percent of the Canadian population; this figure far exceeded the percentage of Canadians born in any other country except the United Kingdom, and does not take into account immigrants from elsewhere who may have lived in the United States before finally settling in Canada. Conversely, by 1900 the United States boasted well over a million Canadian-born residents, making Canada its third largest source for immigrants after Germany and the British Isles. Given the breadth and depth of the relationship, some Canadian commentators welcomed the sight of American flags on their streets. "When a citizen of one country resident in another flies his own national flag on a holiday, the act is almost invariably a compliment and not an act of hostility," observed the editor of the Winnipeg Manitoba Free Press in 1906. "It symbolizes the cordial feelings existing between the two countries, and in particular between him who hoists and it and the people among whom he is resident." The editor of the Wiarton Echo was similarly mystified by the hostility shown the American flag in his community: "There is no country in the world that we should cultivate a more friendly feeling with than the Americans. It is our principal market for many things, [and] they are our blood relations in many instances."3

Yet in spite of a long history of cordial relations, anti-Americanism remained deeply engrained in Canadian culture. It traced its origins to the birth of both countries, in the revolution (or rebellion, depending on one's point of view) of 1776-1783. As the American political scientist Seymour Martin Lipset observed a quarter-century ago, "Americans do not know but Canadians cannot forget that two nations, not one, came out of the American Revolution." Lipset argued that Canada has served for two centuries as the United States' counterrevolutionary foil, a model of what might have been had British arms prevailed at Ticonderoga and Yorktown. Fear of American influence and expansion has underpinned a good number of Canadian national projects, from the movement for confederation of the British North American colonies in the 1860s through the construction of the Canadian Pacific Railway in the 1880s to the reciprocity and free trade elections of 1911 and 1988 respectively. However, given the inextricably entwined economic and social experiences of the two countries, Canadian anti-Americanism operates more effectively as symbol and rhetoric than in practice. In this context, it is unsurprising that the American flag would become a contested cultural symbol for Canadians.⁴

Incidents involving the American flag in Canada offer a view into the evolution of Canadian flag culture. Vexillologist Scot Guenter has coined the term "flag culture" to encompass the functions that flags serve, the contexts in which a society deems it appropriate to display flags, and the rituals that accompany flag display. After the Civil War, Guenter argues, the American flag became more visible as citizens embraced this official emblem as a personal symbol of identity. This movement toward broad display of the flag brought with it new rituals, such as the daily unfurling of the flag and recitation of the pledge of allegiance at the nation's public schools. Canadians were well aware of the changes in American flag culture, both through reports in the press and through its manifestations in their own country. Canadians' responses to these manifestations illustrate the tensions that underlay the shifting function of flags in Canadian culture. As Alistair Fraser has noted, Canadians at the turn of the century found themselves torn between the relatively staid flag culture of Great Britain, in which the Union Jack remained first and foremost a state emblem, and the increasingly boisterous "flag worship" of their American neighbours. Many late-nineteenth-century Canadians might have agreed that the widespread display of the Stars and Stripes on Canadian soil was at best discourteous and at worst an affront to Canadian sovereignty. Where they disagreed was on the solution. 'Vexilloclasts'—vigilantes like those who destroyed the Yeomans family's flag—were a small but highly visible minority: their antics earned them notoriety from coast to coast and in the United States. The more measured

Reverend Bennett represented another faction, which believed that regulation was the answer to the preponderance of American flags. Neither desecration nor regulation proved satisfactory to most Canadians, however. Instead, a third option—emulation—gained widespread support. In the aftermath of the sensational flag incidents of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries we may discern the beginnings of a common North American flag culture.⁵

Accounts of Canadian opposition to the display of the Stars and Stripes date back to the first half of the nineteenth century, though in the earliest cases it was sometimes Canadians who flew the flag themselves to protest colonial misrule. Throughout the long campaign for democratic reform during the 1830s and 1840s, some more radical reformers adopted American republican emblems; for example, the flag attributed to William Lyon Mackenzie's shortlived "Provisional Republic of Upper Canada" of 1837 was clearly American in its inspiration. Even after British forces suppressed the Rebellions of 1837 and 1838, American flags occasionally flew at reform rallies, much to the chagrin of the moderate reform leadership. One leader, James Hamilton, discouraged the display of all partisan or foreign banners at a rally at Dundas, Ontario, in 1839, urging attendees instead to unfurl only "the 'meteor flag'"—the Union Jack—to demonstrate the reformers' commitment to peaceful, orderly assembly. "It is by such a course only," he wrote in a broadside, "[that] you can expect either the approbation of your fellow subjects, or good to flow from your deliberations."6

More widely visible than politically motivated flag-flying during the pre-Confederation period were American flags flown on ships. In the Maritime Colonies, in British Columbia, and in the Great Lakes region, British North American settlements were in constant maritime contact with nearby American ports. Ships of British and American registry routinely carried passengers and goods across the border; the steamship United States, for example, crossed the international boundary four times in the course of its weekly scheduled sailing from its home port at Ogdensburg, New York, on the St. Lawrence River, to Lewiston, at the foot of Niagara Falls. (Figure 1) By longstanding maritime convention, ships fly the flags of their host as well as their home country while in foreign waters. To further complicate matters, it was not uncommon for ships to be sold across the line; thus, residents of a Canadian harbour community might see familiar ships anchored in their port flying American colours, and vice versa. For those unfamiliar with maritime flag conventions, the sight of a Canadian ship, or even a formerly Canadian ship, flying the Stars and Stripes might have come as a surprise.7



Figure 1. Broadside advertising the 1834 schedule of the steamboat United States, which plied the route between Ogdensburg and Lewiston, New York, calling at American and Canadian ports in between. Source: Toronto Public Library, Baldwin Collection of Canadiana, 1834 U.S.

Certainly American captain D. P. Dobbins was in for a rude surprise in 1838 when angry townsfolk attempted to burn his vessel, the *Nicholas Biddle*, while at anchor in the Lake Erie port of Dunnville, Ontario; his alleged crime was having flown the American flag from his mast on a Sunday, but the mob only succeeded in sending a musket shot through one of his schooner's sails. Similarly indignant were the five assailants of John Jones, mate of the schooner *Superior*, who inadvertently placed his ship's American flag above a British ensign when hanging the flags to dry while docked at Kingston, Ontario, in 1841. Jones's explanation was eminently practical—the American flag was larger and he was concerned that it might touch the surface of the lake had he suspended it below the British one—but this did not prevent his angry fellow mariners from seizing and ripping up the American colours. A trial ensued before Kingston Police Court. The twenty-six-year-old lawyer who prosecuted the case on behalf of Jones and his employer, ship owner John Ives, argued

that the vandals' "pretended zeal of loyalty" did not excuse their disrespect for private property. The cowardly attack on the *Superior*, he shrewdly asserted, was akin to "lynch law," as typical of anarchic American republicanism as the very flag the vandals found so objectionable. The court agreed and fined the five men five shillings each (one dollar under the prevailing exchange rate), and 7/6 (\$1.50) for damages, under the province's *Petty Trespass Act*. The young lawyer's rhetorical skill and legal acumen, evident in this and other cases throughout the 1830s and 1840s, portended a brilliant political career: from his legal practice in Kingston, John Alexander Macdonald would go on to become the first prime minister of the Dominion of Canada in 1867.8

Objections to shipborne American flags continued throughout the nineteenth century, and confusion over protocol seemed to be the root cause. The flag on the American steamer Magnet was cut down overnight while docked in Montréal in 1865. In 1886, the captain of a Canadian revenue cruiser caused diplomatic protests to fly when he defied an order from his superiors to release the detained American fishing schooner Marion Grimes; the Canadian official wanted to punish the ship's crew, who persisted in flying the American flag while their vessel was in custody in the port of Shelburne, Nova Scotia. In 1910, two boys belonging to a Toronto rowing club swam from the club's headquarters to an anchored yacht, the West Wind of Buffalo, New York, and tore its flag to shreds in what the Toronto Globe described as "a foolish manifestation of hostility." A correspondent of the same paper, "B.C.", responded to the coverage with a prècis of maritime flag law. "If such simple rules and courtesies were better understood and more generally followed there would be fewer misunderstandings," he concluded. The sensitivities of passengers added a further complication. In 1890, members of a Kingston militia band refused to board the steamer St. Lawrence for a cruise in the Thousand Islands unless the ship's American flag was removed; in Windsor, the men of the 48th Highlanders reportedly demanded the same of the captain of an excursion vessel in 1895. Conversely, American residents of Dawson City, Yukon Territory, compelled the captain of the *Tyrrell*, a Canadian-registered steamer, to fly the Stars and Stripes for a children's excursion up the Yukon River in 1904, provoking an investigation by the local inspector of customs, Edward Busby, incidentally, had provoked a flag incident of his own just three years earlier when, as Canadian customs agent at Skagway, Alaska, he flew a makeshift Canadian Red Ensign over his office, whence his angry American neighbours tore it down. In the Klondike borderlands, where Canadians and Americans mingled in similar numbers, the display of both flags was exceedingly common. (Figure 2)9



Figure 2. Decorations for St. Andrew's Night, Dawson City, Yukon, 1899. Source: City of Vancouver Archives (CVA) AM54-S4-: Out P1108.

On land, violent responses to the display of American flags intensified as the nineteenth century drew to a close. A string of incidents resulted from the volatile combination of patriotism and male bravado, often with alcohol and firearms thrown in for good measure. When Joel Smith, an undertaker, carriage maker, and blacksmith, refused to lower the Stars and Stripes flying over his Mount Hope, Ontario, home to mark the Fourth of July, 1890, angry neighbours riddled the flag with bullet holes. When Smith defiantly raised a second flag, it met the same fate as the first. In 1892, the same year as the infamous Wiarton incident, militiamen in Montreal compelled a hatter on St. Lawrence Street to remove an American flag from his storefront, where it had been hung alongside British and French colours in decorations for the Queen's Birthday. 10 The American consul general, Charles L. Knapp, downplayed the affair, reporting to his government that the soldiers were "under the influence of liquor at the time." In 1897, machinist Peter Martin pled guilty to having destroyed an American flag displayed at Toronto city hall to welcome American delegates to a Methodist convention. Martin, described by the press as "an over-enthusiastic Scotchman," confessed to having had "a few drinks in me" and was fined one dollar and costs. In Trenton, Ontario, in 1903, police magistrate Thomas O'Rourke fined a youth for firing upon an American flag. The following year on the Fourth of July, in the border town of Windsor, across the river from Detroit, a group of boys staked out the home of John Kelley, an Irish-American engineer, armed with a long pole tipped with a bent nail to remove the American flag flying there. In a much publicized 1905

incident, a "drunken man" tried to remove an American flag from the balcony of a London, Ontario, hotel, where it had been hung by visiting members of a Port Huron, Michigan, Orange Lodge. Lest these incidents suggest that anti-Stars-and-Stripes sentiment was confined to central Canada, residents of Digby, Nova Scotia, tore down an American flag flown over a Canadian Red Ensign on the Fourth of July, 1897, and spectators' displays of American flags during militia parades in Winnipeg and Saskatoon in 1913 ended with the offending flags being trampled under the soldiers' boots.¹¹

Perhaps the most brazen of assaults on the American flag were those perpetrated against United States consulates. In 1900, there were over a hundred American consulates, consulates general, and consular and commercial agencies throughout the country, often in small communities. In contrast with the heavily guarded diplomatic missions of today, most were modest operations, in storefronts or rented offices; a consular office was easily identifiable by its flag, which was often displayed tantalizingly within reach of prospective vexilloclasts. (Figures 3 and 4) As a courtesy, consulates customarily flew their own national flags on Canadian national holidays, and for the Queen's Birthday in 1894, George Willis, the American consul at the southwestern Ontario railway town of St. Thomas decorated his office with not one but three flags, including a large sixteen-foot banner that dangled over the sidewalk from the consulate's second-floor front window. Around eight o'clock that evening, a group of inebriated members of the Queen's Own Rifles, a militia unit visiting from Toronto for a military exercise, tore down this largest flag. To Willis, the affair had the makings of an international incident, and he immediately telegraphed the Secretary of State, Walter Q. Gresham, requesting instruction. A half-hearted apology from the Rifles' commanding officer did little to assuage his anger. "It was done by malicious men," Willis wrote in his dispatch to the State Department, "deliberately and with the intention of exhibiting their utter disrespect for the Consul, the Consulate and for the United States." Within days newspapers as far away as California picked up the story and federal authorities in Ottawa promised an investigation. The circumstances of two other assaults were quite similar. The American vice-consul at Winnipeg flew a Union Jack under his office's Stars and Stripes for Victoria Day, 1907, only to have the American flag stolen and destroyed by, as the press described them, "two hoodlums whose patriotism exceeded their discretion." Two years later, two young men in Victoria, British Columbia, scaled the roof of that city's American consulate; unlike their cohorts in St. Thomas and Winnipeg, however, they refrained from destroying the flag and instead hoisted it upside

down under a Canadian Red Ensign. As in the St. Thomas incident, the press presumed that alcohol to be a contributing factor.¹²



Figure 3. United States Consulate, Vancouver, British Columbia, 1902. Note the proximity of the flag to the sidewalk. Source: CVA AM54-S4-Bu P350.



Figure 4. United States Consulate, Collingwood, Ontario, 1890s. Note that the cleat securing the flagpole cord, to the left of the window, is within easy reach of the ground. Source: Collingwood Museum x969.668.1.

As these episodes illustrate, civil authorities and the press dismissed the worst acts of vexillological vandalism as the excesses of youth, drunks, and "hoodlums." "Canadians do not need to manifest their love for their own flag by professing hatred for the flag of another land," opined the Toronto *Globe* in

the aftermath of the St. Thomas flag incident. "Verily they should hang their heads in shame," concluded a correspondent of the same paper when he contemplated the perpetrators of the Wiarton incident. Yet respectable Canadians were equally alert when Americans showed discourtesy to Canadian or British emblems. In 1900, Kingston police arrested a visiting American soldier who, having imbibed a little too liberally, forcibly removed a Union Jack from the front of a hotel to keep as a souvenir. In 1909, a group of American visitors to Toronto deliberately dragged a Canadian ensign through the mud behind their vehicle, provoking much indignation in the local press. It was this incident that impelled Clifford Bennett to complain to Premier Whitney about the overabundance of American flags in Wiarton. Moreover, Whitney and others were well aware that Americans frowned upon the display of British and Canadian flags in their cities. Reports of flag incidents south of the border, in which disrespect was shown to the Union Jack and to those who flew it, appeared regularly in Canadian papers. Vexilloclasm was not respectable, but it was perhaps understandable considering the boorish behaviour of some Americans at home and abroad. 13

In this climate, seemingly minor incidents took on great significance. "E.J.G." of Ancaster, Ontario, was outraged to have an American flag "flaunted" in his face by a man dressed as Uncle Sam aboard a ship on Lake Muskoka in 1907. Similarly, the American flag "flaunted"—that word again—from their sleigh earned several students of the Ontario Ladies' College in Whitby a stern rebuke from their local newspaper. Most trivial of all, but nevertheless warranting press coverage, petitions, and outraged city council resolutions, were tinted postcards that accidentally depicted the Stars and Stripes flying over Canadian cities. Often these were produced in Germany, and the tinters might be forgiven for their ignorance of North American geography. Nevertheless, when Stedman Brothers of Brantford, Ontario, distributed a card that showed Old Glory above the Hamilton city hall, Hamilton's civic Board of Control demanded that the postcard be removed from circulation and that customs officials prevent the importation of such postcards in the future. (Figure 5) A very similar incident transpired when Curt Teich and Company of Chicago produced a set of postcards that depicted American flags over a number of downtown Vancouver commercial buildings. A local chapter of the Imperial Order Daughters of the Empire (IODE), a women's patriotic organization analogous to the Daughters of the American Revolution, got wind of the cards and, along with the Vancouver Board of Trade, demanded an explanation from the manufacturer. The answer was innocuous enough: a tinter had mistakenly assumed that the postcards depicted the city of Vancouver, Washington. The

Royal Canadian Mint in Ottawa was the victim of similar confusion, raising eyebrows when it sported an American flag in a 1920 postcard. The same fate befell the provincial parliament building in Toronto in an undated card published by local novelty manufacturer Nerlich and Company. (Figure 6) This particular affront, however, seems to have evaded public censure.¹⁴



Figure 5. Tinted postcard erroneously depicting an American flag flying above the city hall in Hamilton, Ontario, c. 1907. Source: author's collection.



Figure 6. An American flag floats over the lawn of Ontario's provincial parliament, Toronto, in this undated (c.1910) tinted postcard. Source: author's collection.

Even more distressing to some patriotic Canadians than American insolence was their fellow Canadians' excessive use of the American flag as decoration. For voluntary societies with cross-border connections, decorating with American flags was a mark of respect and welcome for American brethren and guests. Agricultural and industrial exhibitions also decorated with American flags, and even organized "American Days," to encourage cross-border tourism. Fashion alone spurred other trends, such as the use of small American flags alongside British ones to decorate the handlebars of bicycles. (Figure 7) Opponents were vocal in their criticism of these practices. In 1894, Major Louis William Coutlee of the Winnipeg Field Battery refused to allow his men to participate in decorating a drill hall for a charity dance because he objected to the number of American flags among the decorations. A visitor to Victoria, British Columbia, in 1909 was astonished by the prevalence of American flags decorating the city's streets and buildings, and admonished the organizers of the Victoria Exhibition for allowing Old Glory to fly above a British White Ensign on one of their pavilions. In 1910, both the IODE and the Canadian Club complained to Vancouver City Council about "the too frequent display of foreign [i.e., American] flags on the Streets unaccompanied by the British flag." So sickened was one Toronto resident by the "humiliating" ubiquity of the Stars and Stripes that he could empathize with those who vandalized American flags. "I always long to throw a stone through the window of a house showing the symbol of truckling subserviency," confessed "T.C.P." in a letter to the *Globe* in 1893.15



Figure 7. The American flag as a fashion accessory. Source: Edmonton Bulletin (Edmonton, Alberta), 7 August 1899.

Tempting as stone-throwing might have been, limiting the use of the American flag in Canada by legal means seemed a more reasonable course of action. Regulation of foreign flags did appear during the late nineteenth and earlier twentieth centuries, albeit on a piecemeal and highly localized basis. In Trenton, Ontario, organizers of Dominion Day festivities in 1889 made a deliberate decision to exclude American flags from the decorations. At the Detroit-Windsor border crossing, Canadian customs officials occasionally refused entry to groups or automobiles displaying an American flag without an accompanying

Union Jack; in Toronto and Calgary, and in Ingersoll, Ontario, police sometimes removed American flags from automobiles for the same reason. The legal foundation for these decisions was questionable, and such enforcement seemed to depend on the whims of individual officers. Some Canadians hoped to see more general legislation. In 1906, the members of Toronto's Empire Club resolved unanimously that "the flying of foreign flags should be only on proper authority and on permission being given." In Greenwood, British Columbia, a mining town not seven miles from the international boundary, the editor of the *Ledge* newspaper suggested a licensing system to defuse flag incidents on both sides of the border. "If in each of the two countries it were the rule that there should be no private flying of the flag of the other except to [sic] holders of permit, flag incidents would become rare, for anyone found guilty of desecrating a foreign flag whose owners had license to hoist it would be subject to penalties. Of course, it is assumed that the privilege of flying an American flag in Canada would be strictly limited." Such comprehensive suggestions came to naught, but flag regulation did gain traction in one novel area of government competence, the censorship of motion pictures. Before the First World War, first the city of Toronto and then the provinces of Ontario and British Columbia banned the screening of films that depicted excessive American flag display or American flags flying in battle scenes, much to Hollywood's chagrin. Ontario's law, eventually extended to include all foreign flags, was in force into the 1920s.16

However, most critics of American flag-flying in Canada advocated neither direct action nor regulation. They favoured instead emulation of American flag practices: the solution to flag-related violence was more flags, not fewer. From the 1890s onward, arguments in favour of the wider display of the Union Jack and the Canadian Red Ensign routinely, and paradoxically, invoked the inherent superiority of American patriotic practice. "The example of our [American] cousins is worthy of commendation and of being followed," observed the editor of the Windsor Evening Record, comparing patriotic cultures in an 1898 editorial. As the city of Victoria prepared for the Queen's Birthday the same year, one alderman urged his fellow citizens to follow their southern neighbours' example in flaunting their colours. "It was a noticeable fact that the Americans when they held celebrations floated their stars and stripes everywhere while here there seemed to be a backwardness," he lamented. "Let this be overcome and let the Union Jack fly on every staff in the city. A strong display of patriotism ought to be made." Editors throughout the country worried that Canadian holidays held neither a Roman candle nor a flag to their American counterparts. Comparing Empire Day—a celebration of the late

Queen Victoria's birthday aimed principally at school children—to Flag Day in the United States, the Hamilton, Ontario, Spectator lamented that "where [Empire Day] lacks ginger, [Flag Day] is full of it." Similarly, the Lacombe, Alberta, Western Globe hoped that self-respecting Canadians might celebrate Dominion Day with as much enthusiasm as expatriate Americans marked the Fourth of July. "There is neither reason nor loyalty in our looseness about our national colors and our national holidays," admonished the editor, "and they who offend mostly now would be first to commend if we stood out for the dignity of the thing a little more." H. M. Walker, the opinionated editor of the Enderby, British Columbia, Press, concluded that complaints about American flags and proposals for coercive remedies distracted from the more pressing matter of Canadians' deficient patriotism. "We look upon the whole matter [of flag-flying] as something of very little importance until some good American has the boldness to fly the stars and stripes. Then, instead of going him one better and hoisting two Canadian flags for his one, as would be the case on the other side with the flags reversed, we whine about his loyalty to his flag and sit down. . . . We are more jealous of our cousins' loyalty that we are proud of our own."17

Where vigilantism met with general condemnation and proposals for regulation fell on deaf ears, the suggestion that Canadians should emulate American flag practices was generally well received. The introduction of school flag-flying in Canada is a case in point: here we may draw a direct line between an incident involving an American flag and a consequent increase in Canadian flag display. On the Fourth of July, 1906, the city of Winnipeg hoisted the Stars and Stripes at city hall as a courtesy to American residents observing their national holiday. The incident warranted the usual mention in the press both in Winnipeg and elsewhere and the customary expression of opposition from a patriotic society, in this case the city's Canadian Club. However, a more long-reaching response came from the Premier of Manitoba, Sir Rodmond Palen Roblin. In September 1906, announcing a forthcoming provincial election, Roblin cited the city hall flag incident two months earlier as justification for his campaign promise to institute daily flag display in public schools. Notwithstanding the howls of the opposition, who warned that Roblin's school flag policy was a distraction from his lacklustre performance while in government, his Conservatives were returned to power and it became compulsory for public schools to fly the Union Jack, on pain of losing their provincial subsidy. Not only did the display of the American flag in Winnipeg provoke the Manitoba school flag regulation, but the law itself expressly followed American precedents: between 1889 and 1900, some nineteen American states and territories had enacted

similar legislation. In Canada, three provinces—Ontario, British Columbia, and New Brunswick—followed Manitoba's lead in encouraging the use of flags in schools, and in each province proponents invariably cited both the Manitoba and American precedents. In New Brunswick, school flag display was even accompanied by a pledge of allegiance, adapted from Francis Bellamy's pledge to the Stars and Stripes.¹⁸

Supporters of school flag-flying seemed to acknowledge the cognitive dissonance evident in importing American flag practices to combat American flag practices. The Victoria Daily Colonist, a Conservative paper, supported Roblin's policy, against the criticism of a Liberal organ, the Manitoba Free Press. The Free Press's opposition to compulsory flag-flying, the Colonist offered, was nothing but an effort to placate unassimilated American immigrants. The paper did acknowledge the potential criticism of the policy as overly American in itself, but weakly noted that this opposition had not yet been raised. Certainly the institution of school flag-flying in Canada heralded a departure from a British flag culture toward an American one. In the United Kingdom, confusion over the proper use of the Union Jack persisted into the early twentieth century: was the flag a royal emblem, unsuited for unofficial use, or was it a popular national flag? Early twentieth-century proposals to require national schools in Great Britain to display the Union Jack fizzled, with critics characterizing school flag-flying as a peculiarly American institution; only in the 1920s did another British dominion—New Zealand—follow the North American example and require flag display in schools.¹⁹

Not only were Britons more modest than Canadians in displaying their colours over schools, some commentators suggested that they were even more tolerant than Canadians of American flags on their streets. "T.C.P.", who fantasized about breaking the windows of houses flying the American flag, noted that it was all very well for the British public to tolerate or even condone the use of the American flag there. "In England an American flag has no special meaning, passing with the Italian, Austrian, or any other," he wrote, "Here [in Canada] it is different." A correspondent of the London *Morning Post*, dispatched to Canada to cover the tour of the Duke and Duchess of Cornwall in 1901, remarked that Canadians were, in fact, restrained in their display of American flags. In Victoria, for example, he saw very few American flags amid the "bunting . . . so lavishly displayed" in honour of the royal visitors. In British cities, he complained, the Stars and Stripes were ubiquitous during public celebrations. In fact, Victoria's decorations committee, under the chairmanship of contractor George Jeeves, had insisted that the Stars and Stripes

not be flown during the royal visit, even on private homes. In their rush to emulate the flag culture of their American neighbours rather than their British progenitors, would Canadians become as implacably intolerant of American flags as Americans allegedly were of emblems not their own?²⁰

It turns out the Jeeves and his committee were outliers; the American flag remained a regular feature of Canadian celebratory decoration into the 1920s, increasingly with the assent and even encouragement of the very patriotic organizations that had once opposed it. These organizations, especially those with businesspeople on their membership rolls, must have recognized the value of trade and tourism with the United States, particularly as automobile travel became more common. However, they insisted that the Stars and Stripes be displayed alongside a British or Canadian flag. In 1923, for example, the Canadian Club of Victoria presented both British and American flags to the city's auto tourist camp; tourism from the United States became an increasingly important contributor to Victoria's economy throughout the 1920s, and its British character was not only a point of patriotic pride but an important attraction for visitors. Flying both flags seemed an appropriate compromise.²¹

In decorations for national holidays, a case study of Vancouver Dominion Day celebrations suggests that flag display generally became more popular in the twentieth century and that American flags, although still prominent, were gradually outnumbered by Union Jacks and Red Ensigns. In an 1890 photograph of a Dominion Day procession on Cordova Street, (Figure 8) a Red Ensign floats above a bootmaker's shop and several others are visible above other buildings in the distance. In the foreground, a passing carriage sports a Union Jack, while passengers on an electric streetcar wave at least two American flags. Although Canadian, British, and American flags are in evidence, there is hardly the profusion of bunting that one would expect on a national holiday; indeed, only the flags on the carriage and the streetcar were specifically Dominion Day decorations, as the Red Ensigns on the businesses are visible in another view of the same block taken on an ordinary day the same year. A third photograph of the same intersection, taken on Dominion Day 1907, (Figure 9) shows more effusive decoration. Strings of Union Jacks span the streets and single flags hang from storefront awnings. There is not an American flag in sight, perhaps not surprisingly as the photograph was taken in the decade before the First World War, at the height of anti-American flag sentiment in Canada. Even the window of the Knights of Pythias Hall, a fraternal lodge originating in the United States, displays a Canadian Red Ensign.²²



Figure 8. "Procession July 1, 1890, Cordova Street Vancouver." Note the Red Ensign on the building to the right, the Union Jack on the carriage in the foreground, and American flags on the streetcar. Source: CVA 1376-375.20.



Figure 9. "Parade, Cordova Street, Dominion Day," 1 July 1907. Note the flags suspended from buildings and strung across the street. Source: CVA 677-533.

Fast forward to 1924, and a photograph of the corner of Hastings and Abbott Streets decorated for Dominion Day. (Figure 10) Flags abound in this image, including two American flags fluttering prominently over the street in the foreground. However, they are more than outnumbered. Two Union Jacks flank the Stars and Stripes; in the background, strings of Union Jacks and Red Ensigns again waft over the streetcar tracks, while Union Jack bunting and Red Ensigns on staffs adorn every lamp standard. More Union Jacks float from

storefronts, and the façade of Woodwards Department Store boasts a large electrically-illuminated Union Jack escutcheon, whence festoons of bunting also hang. Patriotic organizations continued to grumble—the Canadian Club of Vancouver once again complained to city council in 1926 about "the lavish use of flags other than our own" as Dominion Day decorations—but a willingness to include American flags while ensuring that Canadian and British flags predominated otherwise had broad support. The city's decoration committee for the Diamond Jubilee of Confederation in 1927 opted for a quota system: half of the flags to be displayed would be Canadian ensigns, a quarter Union Jacks, and the remainder the emblems of other countries. Additional American flags would be displayed on 4 July "out of courtesy to the Americans who will spend their national holiday here." American flags thus remained a feature on Vancouver streets, but the proliferation of Canadian and British emblems neutralized their power to offend Canadian sensibilities.²³



Figure 10. "Woodward's Store at Hastings Street and Abbott Street, July 1, 1924." Flags, including a couple of American ones, flutter from every storefront and lamp standard, and from cords across the street. Source: CVA 809-24.

A 1927 postcard of the village of Chesley, Ontario, (Figure 11) some fifty kilometres (thirty miles) from Wiarton, where our story began, suggests that the new proliferation of flags was not limited to Vancouver, or even to large cities. In this image, Union Jacks and Red Ensigns flutter from the cornices and window jambs of the main street's commercial buildings; as in Vancouver, though on a smaller scale, they also hang from cords spanning the roadway. Moreover, the original photograph from which the postcard was produced,

taken on King George V's birthday, 3 June 1920, shows that the postcard publisher edited out additional flags, including a giant Union Jack suspended across the street in the foreground. (Figure 12) By the 1920s, Canadians had lost any compunction they once had about proudly flaunting their national flags. The proliferation of flags in Canada has continued to this day: Canadians are used to seeing their flag everywhere, from homes and cottages to schools and businesses, on cars, boats, buses, and countless novelty items. The widespread use of the flag is especially apparent on Canada Day, when the national flag hangs from every streetlight in the centres of major cities and many revellers don red and white clothing and paint their faces with maple leaves.



Figure 11. Main Street, Chesley, Ontario. The profusion of flags is the striking feature of this view of a small Ontario town in the 1920s. Source: author's collection.



Figure 12. Main Street, Chesley, ON, 3 June 1920. The source for the postcard in Figure 11, this photograph shows that even more flags decorated Main Street in Chesley for the King's Birthday in 1920. Source: Bruce County Museum A2011.101.009.

Canadian flag culture is ubiquitous and unabashed, and when contrasted with the relatively conservative use of the Union Jack and the Canadian Red Ensign at the beginning of the twentieth century, it appears strikingly similar to American practice. Exposure to late-nineteenth-century American flag culture played an important part in the evolution of Canadian practice. As patriotic Canadians confronted with a seeming profusion of American flags on their ships, their streets, and the homes of their neighbours, several possible responses presented themselves. The first—direct action—suggested the viscerally emotional character of nineteenth-century Canadian anti-Americanism. A small minority of Canadians were so enraged at the sight of an American flag that they felt compelled to remove and destroy it, regardless of the consequences. The press and public authorities distanced themselves from these over-enthusiastic vexilloclasts, attributing their actions to youth, drunkenness, or general malevolence, even if they sympathized on some level with their motivation. Among more respectable Canadians, the idea that government should restrict the use of American flags in Canada had its champions. However, provincial and federal governments showed little interest in this option; municipal authorities occasionally acted, as did individual peace officers, but these limited actions did little to prevent the Stars and Stripes from appearing on Canadian streets.

The most widely endorsed response to the proliferation of American flags was to combat the phenomenon on its own terms. Newspaper editors, celebration organizers, and patriotic societies urged their compatriots to fly their own flags proudly and in large numbers, in emulation of American practice. This strategy worked. By the 1920s, the Union Jack and the Canadian Red Ensign were far more visible, especially during celebrations such as Dominion Day. Although American flags did not disappear, and even remained an understated element of official holiday decorations, they were less offensive for being less evident, and the "flag incidents" of the 1890s and 1900s rarely recurred after the First World War. Canadian flag culture had matured, and the stimulus for its evolution was the boisterous, unashamed, sometimes insensitive flag culture of the United States.

End Notes

 "Tore it to Ribbons," Globe (Toronto), 4 July 1892; "That Foreign Flag," Daily Colonist (Victoria), 5 July 1892; "Stars and Stripes Torn Down," Wiarton Echo, 7 July 1892; "Around Town," Wiarton Echo, 7 July 1892; "Haul Down that Flag," Times (Prince Albert, Saskatchewan), 13 July 1892.

- Archives of Ontario (hereafter AO), Sir James Pliny Whitney Papers, F 5, MU 3128, Correspondence 1–8 July 1909, Rev. Clifford T. Bennett to Whitney, 8 July 1909; ibid., Whitney to Bennett, 9 July 1909.
- 3. Canada. Statistics Canada, *Historical Statistics of Canada*, Tables G389-395 and G346-400, www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/11-516-x/sectiong/4147439-eng.htm (accessed 2 September 2015); Canada, Department of Agriculture, *Fourth Census of Canada, 1901*, vol. 1 (Ottawa: King's Printer, 1903), 416–17; United States, Census Office, Census Reports, Volume I: *Twelfth Census of the United States, taken in the year 1900* (Washington: United States Census Office, 1901), clxxi; "Concerning 'Flag Incidents," *Manitoba Free Press* (Winnipeg), 10 July 1906; "Stars and Stripes Torn Down," *Wiarton Echo*, 7 July 1892.
- 4. Seymour Martin Lipset, Continental Divide: The Values and Institutions of the United States and Canada (New York: Routledge, 1991), 1. Other works addressing the cultural significance of anti-Americanism and counter-revolutionary symbols in Canada include J. L. Granatstein, Yankee Go Home? Canadians and Anti-Americanism (Toronto: HarperCollins, 1996) and Norman Knowles, Inventing the Loyalists: The Ontario Loyalist Tradition and the Creation of Usable Pasts (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1997).
- Scot Guenter, The American Flag, 1777–1924: Cultural Shifts from Creation to Codification (Rutherford, New Jersey: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 1990), passim; Alistair Fraser, "A Canadian Flag for Canada," Journal of Canadian Studies 25, no. 4 (1990): 68.
- 6. "Troubles in Canada," Vermont Phoenix (Brattleboro), 7 July 1837; Carol Wilton, Popular Politics and Political Culture in Upper Canada, 1800–1850 (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2000), 201; James Hamilton, To the Freeholders and Inhabitants of the County of Halton (Hamilton, Ontario: Hamilton Journal, 1839). For the sake of clarity and consistency, I use the modern names of the provinces, at times anachronistically; therefore, "Ontario" appears throughout, even when "Upper Canada" or "Canada West" might be more accurate for the time period.
- Toronto Public Library, Baldwin Collection of Canadiana, 1834 U.S., Lake Ontario: Arrangements for 1834: The Steamer United States. On ships changing colours, see "The British Steamer Diana," Daily Colonist, 27 August 1867; "Decorating the Yosemite," ibid., 24 December 1887; "Marine Movements," ibid., 12 February 1892.
- 8. "The *Erie Observer*," *St. Catharines Journal* (St. Catharines, Ontario), 28 June 1838; "Kingston Police Court," *Chronicle and Gazette* (Kingston, Ontario), 27 November 1841; "On Tuesday night last," *Kingston Herald* (Kingston), 30 November 1841.
- 9. "Disagreeable Incident: American Flag cut down on steamer Magnet at Murray Bay," *Daily News* (Kingston), 1 August 1865; United States, Department of State, *Papers Relating to the Foreign Relations of the United States . . . 1886* (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1887), 362–72; "Now Under Suspension: Argonaut Members who Joined in Flag Incident," *Globe*, 23 August 1910; "The Proper Flag

- to Fly," ibid., 23 August 1910; "Kingston: Trouble over an American Flag," ibid., 12 June 1890; "A Detroit Liar's Work," *Windsor Evening Record*, 30 May 1895; "A Yukon Flag Incident," *Globe*, 5 July 1904; Brennan McConnell, "Le drapeau britannique passe les frontières," *Cap-aux-Diamants* 120 (2015): 33–34.
- 10. Canadians celebrated Queen Victoria's birthday, 24 May, as a holiday throughout her sixty-four-year reign. After her death, Parliament decreed that the Monday closest to 24 May would remain a holiday in Victoria's memory, called Victoria Day; it also became the day appointed to mark the birthday of the reigning king or queen, regardless of his or her true birthday.
- 11. "On Friday last," Times (Prince Albert, Saskatchewan), 18 July 1890; "The 'Flag Incident," Globe, 19 July 1897; "American Flag Torn Down," Calgary Weekly Herald, 22 July 1897; Library and Archives Canada (LAC), United States Department of State Consular Records, MG 10, A 1, Reel M-620, Charles Knapp to William Wharton, 26 May 1892; "Trenton Youth Fined," Globe, 8 August 1903; "Patriotic 'Kids': Dougall Ave. Youngsters Couldn't Stand for Old Glory," Windsor Evening Record, 5 July 1904; "They Are the Stuff: 'Patriotic Kids' Insist That Old Glory be Kept in Place," ibid., 6 July 1904; "London's Flag Incident," Globe, 14 July 1905; "The Forest City: American Flag Incident Considerably Exaggerated," ibid., 14 July 1905; "Disrespect to Canadian Flag," Daily British Whig (Kingston, Ontario), 5 July 1897; "Flag-Waving Starts Riot in Winnipeg," Globe, 5 July 1913.
- 12. "News of the Province," *Daily Colonist*, 5 May 1893; "A Great Picnic Day," ibid., 2 July 1893; LAC, MG 10, A 1, Reel M-4447, George Willis to Walter Gresham, 25 May 1894; ibid., Willis to Assistant Secretary of State, 26 May 1894; "A Flag Incident at St. Thomas," *Times* (St. Thomas, Ontario), 26 May 1894; "Outraged the Flag," *San Francisco Call*, 26 May 1894; "U.S. Flag Torn Down: Work of Two Hoodlums in Winnipeg," *Globe*, 25 May 1907; "Flag Upside Down: Outrage at U.S. Consulate in Victoria, B.C.," ibid., 27 September 1909; "Starry Bunting is Mishandled," *Daily Colonist*, 28 September 1909.
- 13. "The St. Thomas Flag Incident," *Globe*, 26 May 1894; "The Wiarton Incident," ibid., 13 July 1892; "Pulled Down the Flag," ibid., 25 May 1900; "Must Respect Our Flag," ibid., 8 July 1909; "Insulting the British Flag," *Northern Advance* (Barrie, Ontario), 16 May 1889; "Torn to Pieces," *Daily Colonist*, 19 October 1892; "Maddened by the Union Jack," *Qu'appelle Progress* (Qu'appelle, Saskatchewan), 10 November 1892; "Flag Worship," *Globe*, 12 July 1904; "A Flag Incident," ibid., 9 July 1907.
- 14. "Stars and Stripes in Canada," *Globe*, 31 August 1907; "A sleighload of young ladies," *Whitby Chronicle*, 11 March 1895; "Hamilton Objects to U.S. Flag," *Globe*, 19 April 1911; City of Vancouver Archives (CVA), Imperial Order Daughters of the Empire fonds, Add. MSS 255, Loc. 515-B-4, file 5, Vancouver Municipal Chapter Minutes, 10 and 22 January and 14 February 1911; ibid., Vancouver Board of Trade fonds, Add. MSS 300, Reel M4, vol. 45, Full Board Minutes, 4 February and 7 March 1911; "U.S. Flag on Picture of Mint at Ottawa," *Globe*, 30 July 1920.

- 15. "Burns Anniversary," *Daily Colonist*, 26 January 1892; "Oddfellows of Essex," *Windsor Evening Record*, 6 August 1896; "Shriners Foregather at Annual Session," *Daily Colonist*, 21 November 1908; "Americans Day," *Calgary Weekly Herald*, 20 July 1899; "At a charity ball," *Flesherton Advance* (Flesherton, Ontario), 10 May 1894; "Tolerant of Foreign Flags," *Daily Colonist*, 24 September 1909; CVA, Women's Canadian Club of Vancouver fonds Add. MSS 95, 511-B-5, File 1, AGM Minutes, 7 November 1910; ibid., Add. MSS 255, 515-B-4, File 5, Vancouver Municipal Chapter Minutes, 13 December 1910; "The Flag," *Globe*, 5 August 1893.
- 16. "District Notes," Canadian Statesman (Bowmanville, Ontario, 10 July 1889; "Must Use British Flag," Daily British Whig (Kingston), 7 February 1889; "Fly Canadian Flag Alongside Old Glory," Globe, 5 July 1916; "Another Flag Incident," Cayley Hustler (Cayley, Alberta), 5 July 1911; "A Toronto policeman," Flesherton Advance, 3 June 1925; "An American tourist," Essex Free Press (Essex, Ontario), 29 September 1922; Empire Club of Toronto, The Empire Club Addresses, 1906 (Toronto: Privately printed, 1906), 31; "Flag Incidents," The Ledge (Greenwood, British Columbia), 1 June 1907; "Prohibit American Flags in Toronto," Edmonton Bulletin, 24 October 1911; Ontario, Ontario Film Review Board, "Our History," www.ofrb.gov.on.ca/english/page4.htm (accessed 3 September 2015); "Manufacturers of motion pictures," Phoenix Pioneer (Phoenix, British Columbia), 11 October 1913.
- 17. "Why are the Americans," Windsor Evening Record, 26 March 1898; "The Queen's Birthday," Daily Colonist, 20 April 1898; "The American Empire Day," reprinted from the Hamilton Spectator in the Daily Colonist, 9 June 1905; "We are so Easy," Western Globe (Lacombe, Alberta), 25 June 1907; "From One Man's Point of View," Enderby Press and Walker's Weekly (Enderby, British Columbia), 8 July 1909.
- 18. "Winnipeg's Flag," *Globe*, 7 July 1906; "Canadian Clubs and other Organizations during the Year," *Canadian Annual Review, 1906* (Toronto: Annual Review Publishing Co., 1906), 597. I describe the ensuing discussions of school flag policies, including their American precursors, at length in Forrest D. Pass, "Something Occult in the Science of Flag-Flying': School Flags and Educational Authority in Early Twentieth-Century Canada," *Canadian Historical Review* 95, no. 3 (2014): 321–51.
- "The Winnipeg Free Press," *Daily Colonist*, 27 September 1906; Sir Joseph Pope, *The Flag of Canada* (Ottawa: Privately printed, 1908), 9–10; United Kingdom, House of Lords, *Debates* (London: His Majesty's Stationery Office, 1906), 165: 758–64; "The Flag in Schools," *Daily Colonist*, 20 February 1907; "Schools and the Union Jack," *Times* (London), 19 April 1907; "To Canadians it is a surprise," *Daily Colonist*, 21 June 1907; E. P. Malone, "The New Zealand School Journal and the Imperial Ideology," *New Zealand Journal of History* 7, no.1 (1973): 21.
- 20. "The Flag," *Globe*, 5 August 1893; "Flag Incident," *Daily Colonist*, 29 September 1901; "The Beauties of Victoria," ibid., 12 November 1901.

- 21. British Columbia Archives, Canadian Club of Victoria fonds, N/E/C16, vol. 2, Executive Minutes, 13 April 1923; Michael Dawson, *Selling British Columbia: Tourism and Consumer Culture, 1890–1970* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2005), chap. 2.
- 22. For a view of Cordova Street on an ordinary day in 1890, see CVA 1376-91.
- 23. CVA, Women's Canadian Club of Vancouver fonds Add. MSS 437, Loc. 591-D-4, Scrapbook, 1919–1928, "Rise of Canadian Nationalism Reviewed by Eastern Man," unattributed newspaper clipping, 9 July 1926; Add. MSS 255, Loc. 515-B-5, File 6, Vancouver Municipal Chapter Minutes, 16 May 1927.